

## California Community Colleges Task Force on Student Success Draft Recommendations Sept 2011 Mid-Pacific ICT Center (MPICT) Input

The Regional Leadership Council (RLC) of the Mid-Pacific ICT Center (MPICT.org) has identified Draft Recommendations from the California Community Colleges Task Force on Student Success<sup>1</sup> as a focus for MPICT and a recommended focus for the new California Community College (CCC) ICT Collaborative.

There are issues and recommendations in the report which have big implications for information and communication technologies (ICT) related programs at California Community Colleges, which represent more than half a million CCC enrollments annually. The ICT Workforce employs more than a million Californians today in 1 in 20 private sector jobs. There is strong anticipated growth in ICT Workforce jobs, which pay on average twice the median wage in California, and for which employers report difficulty finding appropriately skilled workers, even in this period of high unemployment. This is an important sector for California and CCCs. The RLC has recommended that MPICT prepare comments and interact with this effort proactively to represent ICT education and advocate for its best interests.

In summary, definitions of student success in the Draft Recommendations ignore major ICT student goals, including: 1) achieving Digital Literacy basic skills, or ICT User competencies needed for success in every academic field and most jobs; and 2) acquiring through individual courses or industry certifications ICT knowledge and skills that lead to gainful employment or employment advancement. Measures of student success should align to student goals, and student goals include more than just academic transfer, degree or certificate completion. It is simply not appropriate to ignore Career Technical Education (CTE), a major stated part of the mission of the California Community College system, in defining student success. It is also not appropriate to ignore distance education or the use of ICT in improving teaching and learning in all academic fields in any long-term strategic study or planning for the California Community College system.

Implementing policies based on these draft recommendations could easily negatively impact ICT related programs at California community colleges, eliminating courses and harming important ICT education and workforce development efforts, and negatively impacting California's society, economy and businesses.

MPICT would like to respectfully request that the Task Force on Student Success consider the implications of these negative impacts and modify its definitions of Student Success to include specific (ICT) student goals currently excluded from the report.

### Background:

**The Mid-Pacific ICT Center ([MPICT.org](http://MPICT.org))** is a Regional Center of Excellence funded by the National Science Foundation Advanced Technological Education program (DUE 0802284) and hosted by City College of San Francisco. MPICT's mission is to coordinate, improve and promote the quality of ICT education, with an emphasis on 2-year colleges, in northern California, northern Nevada, southern Oregon, Hawaii and the Pacific Territories. That includes roughly half of California community colleges.

**The California Community College ICT Collaborative** was created with a 2011-2012 Career and Technical Education Perkins Title IB grant (11-156-001) by the California Community College Chancellor's Office to coordinate, improve and promote ICT education at all 112 of California's community colleges.

---

<sup>1</sup> The Draft is available at

[http://californiacommunitycolleges.cccco.edu/Portals/0/DocDownloads/PressReleases/SEP2011/PDF\\_%20Student\\_Success\\_Task\\_Force\\_Draft\\_Recommendations\\_Sept\\_2011.pdf](http://californiacommunitycolleges.cccco.edu/Portals/0/DocDownloads/PressReleases/SEP2011/PDF_%20Student_Success_Task_Force_Draft_Recommendations_Sept_2011.pdf) Other information on the Taskforce is available at <http://californiacommunitycolleges.cccco.edu/PolicyInAction/StudentSuccessTaskForce.aspx>

## ICT Industry and Employment Data for California

In the information, knowledge and innovation economies of the 21st century, we all increasingly depend on Information and Communication Technologies (ICT). ICT is an umbrella term, widely used outside the U.S. and by the U.N., to encompass all rapidly emerging, evolving, and converging computer, software, networking, telecommunications, Internet, programming, and information systems technologies. These closely interrelated, interdependent, and converging technology areas should be considered together in big picture planning efforts, like policy and educational system development. Many other countries do this, using an ICT framework, allowing them to better understand and justify significant public policy and investments in ICT infrastructure, and in ICT educational system planning and investment.

In all industries, ICT has been, and will continue to be, one of the primary means by which organizations and individuals increase their productivity. For example, according to the U.S. Department of Commerce Bureau of Economic Analysis, in the U.S.: "ICT industries remained strong, rising 9.0 percent. These industries accounted for 4 percent of GDP, but accounted for 30 percent of real GDP growth in 2008."<sup>2</sup>

In the World Economic Forum's Global Information Technology Report 2010-2011: "The last decade has seen... (ICT) dramatically transforming the world, enabling innovation and productivity increases, connecting people and communities, and improving standards of living and opportunities across the globe. While changing the way individuals live, interact, and work, ICT has also proven to be a key precondition for enhanced competitiveness and economic and societal modernization, as well as an important instrument for bridging economic and social divides and reducing poverty."<sup>3</sup>

Students increasingly use ICT to do research, complete assignments, find and apply to educational programs, participate in online courses, communicate with family/friends, and find and apply for jobs – in every academic field. Workers use ICT to communicate, collaborate, and for training and development, in all industries and most organizations. Organizations of all kinds use ICT for strategic advantage, to improve business processes, productivity, and interactions with customers and suppliers. Citizens increasingly rely on ICT for information on myriad topics, to communicate with family, friends, and others, to buy and sell goods and services, to access government information and services, and for support for a large variety of goods and services. We need modern ICT infrastructure and a large, highly skilled ICT workforce to support commerce and to support organizational and economic growth, at all levels of society.

Yet, this quickly moving field is difficult to keep up with, it is confusing to many, the inconsistent use of terms and jargon are alienating, job titles and descriptions are chaotic, and educational program offerings are inconsistent. Some people participate in this new digital economy and some don't—creating a "digital divide," a separation of advantaged technical haves and disadvantaged technical have-nots. As a society, we need a more comprehensive and structured way of preparing our citizens and workforce to productively engage with information and communication technologies.

### U.S. ICT Infrastructure and Education Performance.

The U.S. is falling behind other nations in the quality and capabilities of its ICT infrastructure and ICT educational systems at an alarming rate. For example, regarding ICT infrastructure and implementations, the U.S. has dropped from 1st to 14th in the world in "broadband" penetration according to the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD),<sup>4</sup> and the U.S. has dropped to 17th in the ITU's ICT Development Index.<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> [http://www.bea.gov/scb/pdf/2009/05%20May/0509\\_indyaccts.pdf](http://www.bea.gov/scb/pdf/2009/05%20May/0509_indyaccts.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> The Global Information Technology Report 2010–2011: Transformations 2.0, 10<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Edition, World Economic Forum, Soumitra Dutta and Irene Mia, Preface, [http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF\\_GITR\\_Report\\_2011.pdf](http://www3.weforum.org/docs/WEF_GITR_Report_2011.pdf)

<sup>4</sup> <http://www.oecd.org/dataoecd/21/60/39574903.xls>

<sup>5</sup> International Telecommunications Union: Measuring the Information Society 2011 [http://www.itu.int/ITU-D/ict/publications/idi/2011/Material/MIS\\_2011\\_without\\_annex\\_5.pdf](http://www.itu.int/ITU-D/ict/publications/idi/2011/Material/MIS_2011_without_annex_5.pdf), page13

Regarding education, among 2006 OECD respondents, the U.S. is highest in tuition charged to students for tertiary education, 18th in higher education enrollment rates for students between the ages of 20 and 29, 21st in proportion of population in highly skilled jobs, 26th in completion rates for tertiary education, 2nd in proportion of students who enter a tertiary program and leave without a degree, and 23rd in 15-year old science performance—yet the U.S. is 1st in the percentage of GDP spent on tertiary education.<sup>6</sup>

It is crucial to recognize the importance of ICT infrastructure, education, and workforce development and to proactively work to improve them in a coherent and coordinated manner.

### **ICT Labor Market Information**

Currently, few official employment studies organized around ICT exist in the U.S. MPICT and California Community College Economic and Workforce Development Centers of Excellence co-produced a Phase 2 California ICT Environmental Scan in 2010 and a Phase 3 Environmental Scan in 2011<sup>7</sup>, which researched the importance of ICT industries and employment in the California economy. MPICT's Advisory Panel informed the structure and content of the study, which surveyed more than 600 California companies representative of the geographic, industry and company size diversity of the State. (This produced more statistically significant findings than would be available through any advisory group alone.)

Secondary research of ICT industries in California showed that ICT industries:

- Include 46,000 (4% of all) companies, ranked 12th of CA industries by firm count
- Earn \$172 billion in revenue, 6% of CA private sector (6th of CA industries by) revenues
- Employ 1 million (4% of) California workers, 12th of CA industries by employee counts
- Pay \$76 billion in (12% of private sector) wages, 2nd by private sector wages paid
- Pay average wages per employee twice the state average
- Show significant job growth approaching 20% for ICT industries from 2006 to 2016

Not all jobs in ICT industries are ICT related. ICT industries employ people in accounting, finance, and other non-ICT related roles. Conversely, the ICT Workforce is employed in all industries and most organizations. The 2nd focus of the study was therefore secondary research into ICT employment across all industries. ICT Workforce findings include:

- The U.S. had about 7.6 million ICT workers in 2008, 5% of all private sector jobs, 1 in 20 jobs, estimating employment growth of 14%, over 1 million new positions and 275,000 annual new and replacement jobs, between 2008-2018.
- California had about 1 million ICT Workforce employees, 5% (1 in 20) of private sector jobs in 2010, projecting 12% employment growth, or 130,000 new jobs and 46,000 annual new and replacement jobs in California between 2006 and 2016. Median ICT Workforce hourly wages are about twice the median for all jobs across the state, and ICT is the 8th largest occupational cluster by job count.

Regarding ICT's Strategic Importance and Employment Growth, as of 2010:

- 88% of California firms providing ICT goods and/or services and 80% of California companies that do not provide ICT goods and/or services either agree or strongly agree that information and communications technologies are important to the productivity of their organizations.

---

<sup>6</sup> [http://www.oecd.org/document/9/0,3343,en\\_2649\\_39263238\\_41266761\\_1\\_1\\_1\\_37455,00.html](http://www.oecd.org/document/9/0,3343,en_2649_39263238_41266761_1_1_1_37455,00.html)

<sup>7</sup> These reports are available for download free at [http://www.mpict.org/ict\\_industry\\_employment\\_research.html](http://www.mpict.org/ict_industry_employment_research.html).

- California companies anticipated 3.8% overall employment growth between 2010 and 2012. However, companies providing ICT goods and/or services expected 8.5% employment growth, and those that do not expected overall employment to shrink by 0.4% over that period.
- Overall, 36% of respondents expected to have more people, and only 2% expected fewer, employed in ICT-related job functions in two years.
- California companies anticipated 7% overall ICT Workforce employment growth between 2010 and 2012, significantly higher than the 3.8% overall employment growth estimates.
- Companies providing ICT goods and/or services expected 11.2% ICT Workforce growth between 2010 and 2012, compared with overall employment growth expectations of 8.5%.
- Companies that do not provide ICT goods and/or services expected -0.4% overall employment growth, but expected 3.7% growth in ICT workforce employment.
- More than 50% of firms reported difficulty recruiting employees with appropriate ICT workforce training. (This finding is especially significant in light of a saturated general labor pool due to historically high rates of unemployment.)

### **California Community College ICT Data Analysis.**

In Fall 2009, MPICT conducted a preliminary analysis of 2007/2008 data on ICT-related programs at community colleges in California. Overall, there were over 591,000 student enrollments in ICT courses at California Community Colleges during the 2007/2008 academic year. Of these, approximately 243,000 were in the MPICT region.

Basically, half a million annual California Community College enrollments are in ICT related courses.

### **Mid-Pacific ICT Center (MPICT) Input into California Community Colleges Task Force on Student Success – Draft Recommendations Sept 2011**

Summarizing our input into badly needed revisions to the report:

- Definitions of student success need to map to and not exclude stated goals of the California Community College system. **Career Technical Education (CTE) is a major stated goal and focus of the California Community College system, and CTE can simply not be ignored in developing definitions of student success for the California Community College system.** Transfer, degree completion and academic certificate completion are simply not goals of many students in ICT related programs. Many are working professionals or people who have already achieved baccalaureate or higher degrees, so academic transfer is not a goal. Neither is academic degree or certificate completion. Many are seeking a basic user level knowledge of ICT, or Digital Literacy, so they can succeed as students in any academic field. They currently accomplish that through individual courses, not academic credentials. Many are seeking skills that lead to entry level employment. When they become employed, they have reached their goal, with or without an academic credential. Getting a job is an important measure of student success, and it should be included in definitions for student success for students with that as their goal. Many are seeking to understand and be able to work with new or rapidly evolving ICT technologies. Once they have that knowledge they have met their goal and succeeded, with or without academic degrees or certificates. Many are seeking new knowledge and skills that allow them to accomplish new things in the workplace. That does not require an academic credential.
- It is a mistake to ignore distance education. The use of technology to improve the quality, depth, breadth, efficiency and reach of CC education is an essential strategic issue for the CCC system. It should be considered in every strategic planning decision made for CCCs.

- In the 21<sup>st</sup> century, Digital Literacy, or basic ICT User knowledge and skills should be a component of basic education. Being able to productively use computer, information and communication technologies is an important component of “College Readiness” and “Career Readiness.” Both need digital literacy components that articulate between all public educational systems in California. A basic, core set of knowledge and skills with information and communication technologies are required for student and workplace success in all fields today. This is a basic skills issue comparable with reading, writing and arithmetic.

Specific reactions to Draft Recommendations follow in red below:

## **PART I**

### **Refocusing California Community Colleges on Student Success**

#### **Reorienting Community Colleges to Improve Student Success**

“This plan calls on the state to end both the fragmentation between K-12 and community colleges and between the colleges themselves.”<sup>8</sup>

- *Great! Couldn't agree more.*

“While we emphasize the need for our system to improve basic skills instruction through innovation and flexibility, we urge state leaders to examine the larger, and critical issues, of adult education in California. There is a large, and growing population of adults who lack the basic proficiencies for gainful employment and the state lacks the policies and delivery systems to deal with this challenge.”<sup>9</sup>

- *Basic Skills instruction and basic proficiencies for gainful employment should include Digital Literacy for everyone.*

#### **Report Recommendations Summary:**

“Broadly speaking, the Task Force recommendations rely on the following key components to move students more effectively through our community college system:

- Development and implementation of a common diagnostic assessment tool to better determine the skill levels of entering students;
  - *Fine*
- Expanded use of technology, especially as it relates to students' educational plans;
  - *Great*
- Development of structured pathways to help students identify a program of study and get an educational roadmap to indicate appropriate courses and available support services;
  - *Fine, but pathways leading to jobs are legitimate successes. An academic credential is not necessarily the student goal.*
- Enhanced professional development for both faculty and staff, especially as it relates to the instructional and support needs of basic skills students;
  - *Particularly needed for ICT, because of the pace of change*
- Revised financing, accountability and oversight systems to ensure that resources (both financial and intellectual) are better aligned with student success;
  - *As long as student success is defined appropriately*
- Stronger statewide system coordination and oversight to allow for the sharing and facilitation of new and creative ideas to help students succeed, including the ability for California to “take to scale” the good practices already in place;
  - *Great*

<sup>8</sup> California Community Colleges Task Force on Student Success – Draft Recommendations Sept 2011, Page Number 8

<sup>9</sup> Page Number 9

- Better alignment of local district and college goals with the education and workforce needs of the state.<sup>10</sup>
  - *Great*

## Scope of the Task Force Work

“Distance education and workforce /career technical education, while critical topics to the future of the community colleges, were unable to be discussed due to time and schedule constraints. This report is written as a framework, with workforce / career technical education, in particular, being addressed through the subsequent implementation actions related to student assessment, enrollment prioritization, course offerings and the development of a college-level score card.”<sup>11</sup>

- *Workforce/career technical education is a critical and core component of the community college mission which is not addressed by either the UC or CSU systems. CCCs are the place in California higher education where workforce/career technical education are supposed to be addressed. Student success and student pathways are not all academic, and this has to be recognized. This cannot be left out of the scope of this study and its recommendations or CTE will be subjugated to academic prejudices in implementation actions. Definitions of student success for CTE are not the same as definitions of success for students in academic pathways – especially in ICT.*
- *It is a mistake to ignore distance education. The use of technology to improve the quality, depth, breadth and reach of CC education is an essential strategic issue for the CCC system. It should be considered in every strategic planning decision made for CCCs.*

## Defining Student Success

Students come to California Community Colleges for many reasons. Measuring their success does not fit neatly with a cookie cutter image of a college student. However, most students come to community colleges with one thing in mind: earning a degree or certificate and then getting a job. For some, entering the workforce is in the distance, with success defined as transferring to, and subsequently graduating from, a four-year college. For others, an associate’s degree will meet their academic goal. Still other community college students are looking to gain concrete job skills to help them more immediately enter into the workforce. This could be accomplished by either completing a vocational certificate program or through any number of skill oriented courses. Yet, regardless of their goals, the vast majority of students come to community colleges in need of basic skills such as reading, writing, and mathematics. How do we know if students are succeeding? To acknowledge the varied intent of students, the Task Force adopted a set of Student Success Outcome Metrics. The following metrics represent how the Task Force recommends that the system define whether or not a student (and thus community colleges as a whole) has been successful:

- How many degrees and certificates were earned by students statewide?;
  - *For students who have degrees and certificates as their goal*
- How many students transferred to a four-year institution after completed a transfer curriculum (and how many of those earned associate degrees)?
  - *For students who have completing a transfer curriculum as their goal*
- What percentage of community college students earned a certificate or degree, transfer, or were ready to transfer within a 6-year period.
  - *For students who have completing a certificate, degree or transfer curriculum as their goal*
- What percentage of students whose workforce related goals do not include earning a credential, passed their courses?<sup>12</sup>

<sup>10</sup> Page numbers 10-11

<sup>11</sup> Page number 11

<sup>12</sup> Page 12

- *Fair enough, but how can you do that with CTE outside the scope of the study and its recommendations*

## **Part II, Chapter 1:**

### **Increase Student Readiness for College**

#### **POLICY STATEMENT**

Community Colleges will collaborate with the State Board of Education, the California Department of Education, and other statewide efforts to define and address college and career readiness.<sup>13</sup>

- *“College Readiness” and “Career Readiness” both need digital literacy components that articulate between all educational systems in California. A basic, core set of knowledge and skills with information and communications technologies are required for student and workplace success in all fields today. This is a basic skills issue comparable with reading, writing and arithmetic. This affects Recommendation 1.1*

## **Chapter 2**

### **Strengthen Support for Entering Students**

#### **POLICY STATEMENT**

**Community colleges will provide stronger support for students entering college to identify and meet their goals. Stronger support will be facilitated by centralized, integrated and student-friendly technology to better guide students in their educational planning process.**

#### **Students need guidance.<sup>14</sup>**

- *Agreed, but that guidance needs to include advice and counsel for students who do not like or want extended academic time, but rather want to obtain knowledge, skills and experience that allow them to enter the workforce.*

#### **Assessments vary by college.<sup>15</sup>**

- *We need a common assessment for digital literacy also. Ability to work with information and communications technologies and information literacy are critical success factors in academics, work and life.*

#### **Technology can help.<sup>16</sup>**

- *We could not agree more. Implementation of information and communication technologies has created efficiencies, increased productivity, reduced costs, improved success outcomes and become increasingly strategic and essential in 21<sup>st</sup> century knowledge, information and innovation economies – in all industries, most organizations and most households. Public education should also be implementing ICT to improve its efficiencies and outcomes. It is far behind most other industries in doing so.*
- *There are many opportunities for efficiencies of scale in implementing technologies to improve the administration and operations of education. However, implementing ICT systems to improve education administration, operations, data management and student tracking and counseling is very difficult to achieve when every college is so very different – in locally implemented ICT systems, and in curriculum, academic credentials and assessments. How do you create*

---

<sup>13</sup> Pages 15-16

<sup>14</sup> Page 18

<sup>15</sup> Page 19

<sup>16</sup> Page 20

*pathways across colleges when what happens at those colleges is so very different? (This is particularly true in ICT related programs.)*

- *Distance education has to be a part of this discussion. There are extraordinary opportunities for improvement in this domain. For example, CCCs could compete effectively with University of Phoenix and other online higher education very quickly by simply:*
  - *Creating common definitions of different modes of distance education delivery (asynchronous online, synchronous online, CATV, Internet video, videoconferencing at fixed locations, etc.),*
  - *Creating and requiring common data delimiters for those courses,*
  - *Automating centralized data gathering of all courses in the CCC system,*
  - *Presenting all of those distance education courses via the California Virtual Campus,*
  - *Allowing people to apply, enroll and track progress in those courses through common CCC systems.*

*A simple marketing message would then expand the impact of CCCs enormously, especially to students in rural areas or specialized fields (like ICT) with limited access to CCC educational services: "If you can't find what you want at your local community college, try the California Virtual Campus. It is a clearinghouse for all of the distance education courses of the 112 campus California Community College system."*

- *There are great opportunities for using centrally developed distance education to deliver ICT User/Digital Literacy education to students for Basic Skill remediation.*

#### **Recommendation 2.1**

**Community colleges will develop and implement a common centralized assessment for English reading and writing, mathematics, and English as a Second Language (ESL) that can provide diagnostic information to inform curriculum development and student placement and that, over time, will be aligned with the K-12 Common Core State Standards and assessments.<sup>17</sup>**

- *We need a common assessment for digital literacy also. Ability to work with information and communications technologies and information literacy are critical success factors in academics, work and life. Definitions of digital literacy/ICT User competencies should be consistent across all of public education in California.*

#### **Recommendation 2.2**

**Require all incoming community college students to: (1) participate in (a) diagnostic assessment and (b) orientation, and (2) develop an education plan.<sup>18</sup>**

- *An education plan that includes completion of as few as one course is legitimate if that is all a student needs to do to meet his or her goal. In ICT people from all walks of life frequently take a single ICT course, to learn a new technology or skill, in order to obtain a job or advance in their careers. That is an excellent use of public resources and a success for students, ICT departments, teachers and the community college system.*

#### **Recommendation 2.3**

**Community colleges will develop and use centralized and integrated technology, which can be accessed through campus or district web portals, to better guide students in their educational process.<sup>19</sup>**

- *Obtaining a job, or growing and advancing within a job are important success outcomes that CCCs currently do not track. Being able to report numbers of students obtaining jobs as a result of their engagement with CCCs would be very advantageous to CCCs (and ICT related departments) politically. In fact, the faster a student gets a job and the less time spent in the*

---

<sup>17</sup> Page 22

<sup>18</sup> Page 23

<sup>19</sup> Page 24

*CCC system is in some cases a better success story than spending years in a CCC and not obtaining a job, even if they get an academic credential.*

#### **Recommendation 2.4<sup>20</sup>**

Require students whose diagnostic assessments show a lack of readiness for college to participate in a support resource, such as a student success course, provided by the college for new students.

- *This should include remediation for lack of digital literacy or ICT User knowledge and skills and information literacy for all students.*

#### **Recommendation 2.5<sup>21</sup>**

Encourage students to declare a program of study upon admission and require declaration by the end their second term.

- *A declared program of study option should exist for successful completing specified course(s) or obtaining a recognized industry certification. That is a legitimate CCC student goal.*

### **Chapter 3**

#### **Incentivize Successful Student Behaviors**

##### **POLICY STATEMENT**

**Community colleges will incentivize those student behaviors that are associated with their eventual success.**

##### **Rationing of Classes<sup>22</sup>**

- *Especially in this bad economy, it does not make sense to implement any policy or plans that ration classes that can lead quickly to jobs that help people survive, retrain and improve the overall economy. ICT courses can lead to employment very quickly. Further, ICT skills applied in the real world create efficiencies and productivity that further improve the economy.*

##### **Recommendation 3.1**

The Community Colleges will adopt system-wide enrollment priorities that: (1) reflect the core mission of transfer, career technical education and basic skills development; (2) encourage students to identify their educational objective and follow a prescribed path most likely to lead to success; (3) ensure access and the opportunity for success for new students; and (4) incentivize students to make progress toward their educational goal.<sup>23</sup>

- *Great, recognizing CTE and digital literacy basic skills development missions, including an educational objective of a course or industry certification that improves job prospects, and not rationing classes with good prospects for positive employment outcomes.*

##### **Recommendation 3.2**

Require students receiving Board of Governors (BOG) fee waivers to meet various conditions and requirements, as specified below.

**(A) Require students receiving a BOG fee waiver to identify a degree, certificate, transfer or career advancement goal.**

**(B) Require students to meet institutional satisfactory progress standards to be eligible for the fee waiver renewal.**

---

<sup>20</sup> Page 26

<sup>21</sup> Page 27

<sup>22</sup> Page 28

<sup>23</sup> Page 30

(C) Limit the number of units covered under a BOG fee waiver to 110 units.<sup>24</sup>

- *Fine, recognizing career advancement goals.*

### Recommendation 3.3

Community Colleges will provide students the opportunity to consider the benefits of full-time enrollment.<sup>25</sup>

- *Fine*

### Recommendation 3.4

Community Colleges will require students to begin addressing basic skills deficiencies in their first year and continue remediation as part of their education plan.

- *Fine*

## Chapter 4

Align Course Offerings to meet Student Needs

### POLICY STATEMENT

Community colleges will focus course offerings on meeting student needs.

### Recommendation 4.1

Community Colleges will use the requirements for a student to complete a program of study, along with state and local data, including enrollment trends and labor market demand to develop course schedules and determine course offerings.<sup>26</sup>

- *Fine, recognizing that a successful program of study in ICT can be a single course leading to workplace success.*

## Chapter 5

Improve the Education of Basic Skills Students

**Policy Statement.** The community college system will develop a cohesive statewide framework for the delivery of basic skills educational services.

### Need for Basic Skills Reform<sup>27</sup>

- *This should include digital literacy or ICT User knowledge and skills and information literacy for all students as a new Basic Skill.*

### Professional development is key.<sup>28</sup>

- *This should include digital literacy or ICT User knowledge and skills and information literacy for all teachers.*

### Need to Scale Practices That Work<sup>29</sup>

- *We should have centrally developed, common and consistent standards, assessments and remediation for digital literacy or ICT User knowledge and skills and information literacy throughout the CCC system, rather than having unnecessary duplication of effort and inconsistent results across colleges.*

---

<sup>24</sup> Page 32

<sup>25</sup> Page 34

<sup>26</sup> Page 38

<sup>27</sup> Page 39

<sup>28</sup> Page 40

<sup>29</sup> Page 40

### **Basic Skills is a Shared Responsibility with K-12<sup>30</sup>**

- *We should have centrally developed, common and consistent standards and assessments and remediation for digital literacy or ICT User knowledge and skills and information literacy throughout all California public education systems.*

#### **Recommendation 5.1**

**Community Colleges will support the development of alternatives to traditional basic skills curriculum and incentivize colleges to take to scale model programs for delivering basic skills instruction.<sup>31</sup>**

- *We should have centrally developed, common and consistent standards, assessments and remediation for digital literacy or ICT User knowledge and skills and information literacy throughout the CCC system, rather than having unnecessary duplication of effort and inconsistent results across colleges.*

#### **Recommendation 5.2**

**The state should develop a comprehensive strategy for addressing basic skills education in California that results in a system that provides all adults with the access to education in mathematics, English, and English as a Second Language (ESL).<sup>32</sup>**

- *And Digital Literacy, including both information literacy and ICT User literacies.*

#### **Demise of Adult Education<sup>33</sup>**

- *Helping adults become digitally literate, including both information literacy and ICT User literacies, is an essential 21<sup>st</sup> century education challenge that CCCs are uniquely positioned to address.*

## **Chapter 6**

### **Revitalize and Re-envision Professional Development**

#### **POLICY STATEMENT**

**The community college system will develop and support the continued and focused professional development for all faculty and staff.<sup>34</sup>**

- *Faculty professional development is even more critical in ICT related fields, because of their extraordinary pace of change. ICT faculty and CCC programs quickly become stale and irrelevant and no longer serve educational goals if faculty cannot very regularly participate in ongoing professional development.*
- *Faculty professional development needs to include not only content knowledge and skills, but also changes in pedagogy. One of the most consistent messages employers provide to community colleges relates to the importance of soft, employability or workplace skills. The real world does not work with chalk, textbooks and graded tests. It works to solve problems and add value in team environments. To help students develop these skills, we need educational learning experiences to better reflect real world work environments.*

#### **Recommendation 6.1**

**Community colleges will create a continuum of strategic professional development opportunities, for all faculty, staff and administrators to be better prepared to respond to the evolving student needs and measures of student success.<sup>35</sup>**

---

<sup>30</sup> Page 41

<sup>31</sup> Page 42

<sup>32</sup> Page 44

<sup>33</sup> Page 44

<sup>34</sup> Page 46

<sup>35</sup> Page 50

- *Excellent, please recognize the intensive needs of ICT related faculty and the importance of integrating experiential learning strategies into teaching and learning.*

## RECOMMENDATION 6.2

Community Colleges will direct professional development resources targeted at both faculty and staff toward improving basic skills instruction and support services.<sup>36</sup>

- *Consider reworking this recommendation to better reflect thought contained in “continue to direct and coordinate special programs in vocational education, economic development, science, mathematics, categorical areas, and others in order to integrate basic skills improvement throughout the entire community college system.”*

## Chapter 7

### Enable Efficient Statewide Leadership and Increase Coordination Among Colleges

#### POLICY STATEMENT

The State should authorize greater coordination and support among colleges so that California’s diverse community colleges can function more as a system.

#### Recommendation 7.1

The state should develop and support a strong community college system office with commensurate authority, appropriate staffing, and adequate resources to provide leadership, oversight, technical assistance and dissemination of best practices. Further, the state should grant the Community College Chancellor’s Office the authority to implement policy, consistent with state law.<sup>37</sup>

- *OK*

#### Recommendation 7.2

In collaboration with the CCC Chancellor’s Office, districts and colleges will identify specific goals for student success and report their progress towards meeting these goals in a public and transparent manner (consistent with Recommendation 7.3).<sup>38</sup>

- *OK, but definitions of student success should be consistent across districts and colleges.*

#### Recommendation 7.3

Implement a student success score card.<sup>39</sup>

- *Fine, but a successful completion outcome is completing a single course, series of courses or industry certification, if that is the student’s goal. That should be included in the scorecard.*

#### Recommendation 7.4

The state of California should develop and support a longitudinal student record system to monitor student progress from elementary through postsecondary education and into the workplace.<sup>40</sup>

- *OK*

## Chapter 8

### Align Resources with Student Success Recommendations

#### POLICY STATEMENT

---

<sup>36</sup> Page 51

<sup>37</sup> Page 55

<sup>38</sup> Page 56

<sup>39</sup> Page 57

<sup>40</sup> Page 59

**Both the redirection of existing resources and the acquisition of new resources will be necessary to implement the recommendations contained in this report.**

**Recommendation 8.1**  
**Consolidate select categorical programs.<sup>41</sup>**

- *OK*

**Recommendation 8.2**  
**Invest in the Student Support Initiative<sup>42</sup>**

- *OK*

**Recommendation 8.3**  
**Establish an alternative funding model to encourage innovation and flexibility in the delivery of basic skills instruction.<sup>43</sup>**

- *OK*

**Recommendation 8.4**  
**Do not implement outcomes-based funding at this time.<sup>44</sup>**

- *OK, but if you are going to publicly report metrics against a student success scorecard, please have a student success scorecard that contains metrics consistent with all supported student goals – including completion of courses and industry certifications that lead to workplace success. Do not just count academic credentials and transfer.*

---

<sup>41</sup> Page 63

<sup>42</sup> Page 66

<sup>43</sup> Page 68

<sup>44</sup> Page 70